

Roma Roma Integration Strategies

a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework



Neither the European Commission nor any person acting on behalf of the European Commission may be held responsible for the use that may be made of the information contained in this publication.

The communication National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework - COM(2012) 226 is also available in French and German from the European Commission Roma portal: http://ec.europa.eu/roma

Europe Direct is a service to help you find answers to your questions about the European Union.

Freephone number (*):

00 800 6 7 8 9 10 11

(*) Certain mobile telephone operators do not allow access to 00 800 numbers or these calls may be billed.

European Commission - Directorate-General for Justice

More information on the European Union is available on the Internet (http://europa.eu)

© European Union, 2012

Picture copyright: European Union/Reporters.

Reproduction is authorised provided the source is acknowledged.

Printed in Belgium

Table of content

National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the	
implementation of the EU Framework	.3
Commission staff working document accompanying	
document to the National Roma Integration Strategies:	
a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework	21

Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Commitee and the Committee of the Regions

National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework

1. Introduction

In recent years, the situation of Roma¹ has increasingly become the centre of political attention for Europe. Roma - Europe's largest minority of about 10 to 12 million people - are very often the victims of racism, discrimination and social exclusion and live in deep poverty lacking access to healthcare and decent housing. Many Roma women and children are victims of violence, exploitation and trafficking in human beings^{2,} including within their own communities. Many Roma children are on the streets instead of going to school. Lagging education levels and discrimination in labour markets have led to high unemployment and inactivity rates or low quality, low skill and low paid jobs for Roma. This causes a loss of potential which renders the endeavour to secure growth even more difficult^{3.} Better integration of Roma is therefore both a moral and an economic imperative, which moreover will require a change of mindsets of the majority of the people as well as of members of the Roma

The Member States have the primary responsibility and the competences to change the situation of marginalised populations, so action to support Roma lies first and foremost in their hands. To support them in addressing this situation, the EU has made available a wide range of legal, policy and financial instruments. Although specific national circumstances, needs and required solutions vary greatly across Europe, the shared values of freedom of movement and fundamental rights and the common objectives of political stability, economic prosperity, social cohesion and solidarity between Member States call for a European role in policies for Roma integration. Moreover, the persisting challenges regarding the full integration of Roma who are EU citizens into their societies has a direct impact on wider EU relations with third countries, for instance with regard to the visa requirements applied by some of these to the nationals of certain Member States⁴.

This is why the European Commission on 5 April 2011 adopted an EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020⁵, calling on Member States to prepare or revise National Roma Integration Strategies⁶ in order to address more effectively the challenges of Roma inclusion to tangibly improve the situation by the end of the current decade. The endorsement of the Framework by EU Heads of States and Governments⁷ indicated that Roma inclusion is becoming an important priority for the all Member

States, despite the economic and financial crisis. The aim of the EU Framework is to help Member States to make a tangible difference to Roma people's lives by bringing about a change in the approach to their inclusion. Discrimination on the basis of racial or ethnic origin in education, employment, health and housing as well as other areas is already prohibited by EU law, but legislation alone is not enough: Member States need to develop and implement an integrated and sustainable approach that combines efforts across different areas, including education, employment, health and housing.

The EU Framework addresses Roma inclusion for the first time at EU level and clearly links it with the Europe 2020 strategy. The persistent economic and social marginalisation of the Roma is directly relevant to the strategy. Three out of five Europe 2020 headline targets are directly linked to the EU Framework targets for Roma inclusion: the fight against poverty and social exclusion, raising employment levels, and reducing school drop-out while increasing attendance in tertiary education. For Member States with a larger Roma population making sufficient progress towards the Europe 2020 employment, social inclusion and education targets will require addressing explicitly and swiftly the situation of the Roma.

EU funds (in particular the Structural Funds) could be a powerful tool to improve the socio-economic situation of disadvantaged groups, such as Roma, but too little of the €26.5 billion allocated to support Member States' efforts in the field of social inclusion for the 2007-2013 period benefits disadvantaged Roma communities.

The European Commission has undertaken to assess the National Roma Integration Strategies and to report to the European Parliament and the Council, which is the purpose of the present Communication. In its assessment, the Commission also considers the wide range of contributions received from civil society and other stakeholders and the contributions made at the extraordinary meeting of the European Platform for Roma Inclusion held in Brussels on 22 March 2012.

The adoption of National Roma Integration Strategies will contribute to making a real difference in the lives of the Roma population. In the next phase, efforts must focus on implementation based on action plans with specific measures commensurate with Roma inclusion targets, supported by a clear timetable and appropriate funding.

- ¹ The term "Roma" is used here, as well as by a number of international organisations and representatives of Roma groups in Europe, to refer to a number of different groups (such as Roma, Sinti, Kale, Gypsies, Romanichels, Boyash, Ashkali, Egyptians, Yenish, Dom, Lom) and also includes Travellers, without denying the specificities and varieties of lifestyles and situations of these groups.
- ² Europol Organised Crime Threat Assessment 2011, p. 26.
- 3 Economic costs of Roma exclusion, the World Bank, April 2010 http://siteresources.worldbank.org/ EXTROMA/Resources/ Economic_Costs_Roma _Exclusion_Note_Final.pdf
- ⁴ See, for instance, the concerns expressed by Canada following an increasing number of asylum applications lodged by he nationals of certain Member States.
- ⁵ Communication "An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020", COM(2011)173 of 5 April 2011. The Opinion of the European **Economic and Social Committee** on "Societal empowerment and integration of Roma citizens in Europe". CESE 998/2011 of 16 June 2011 and the Opinion of the Committee of the Regions on "An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020". CdR 247/2011 of 14 December 2011 give both strong support to the EU Framework.
- ⁶ In this communication, the term 'strategy' should be understood as covering both integrated sets of policy measures and strategies.
- Furopean Council conclusions, EUCO 23/11 of 23 and 24 June 2011, following the EPSCO Council Conclusions on an EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020, 106665/11 of 19 May 2011.
- 8 http://ec.europa.eu/ europe2020/ index_en.htm

Assessment of the national strategies

- Malta did not adopt a National Roma Integration Strategy as there is no significant Roma population on its territory.
- The summary tables in the four policy areas consistently address two sets of issues: **goals**, i.e. whether the strategies endorse the general EU goal in the given field set by the EU Framework and whether they set concrete, specific and quantifiable goals; and **measures** (both mainstream and specific for Roma).
- EU Roma integration goals were set out in the Communication "An EU Framework for National Roma Integration Strategies up to 2020", COM(2011)173 of 5 April 2011.
- 12 Preventing Social Exclusion
 through the Europe 2020
 strategy Early Childhood
 Development and the Inclusion
 of Roma Families official
 report of the European
 Platform for Roma Inclusion
 under the Belgian Presidency,
 developed from UNICEF and the
 European Social Observatory in
 collaboration with the Belgian
 Federal Planning Service for
 Social Integration, 2011;
 http://www.ecdgroup.com/pdfs/
 Preventing-Social-Exclusion.pdf
- ¹³ At least 10% of Roma children aged 7 to 15 in Greece, Romania, Bulgaria, Italy and France were identified in the survey as not attending school: they were either still in preschool, not yet in education, skipped the year, stopped school completely or were already working. This proportion is highest in Greece, with more than 35% of Roma children not attending school (The situation of Roma in 11 EU Member States: Survey results at a glance. Fundamental Rights Agency, World Bank, **United Nations Development** Programme, 2012).

By March 2012, all Member States had presented a National Roma Integration Strategy or a corresponding set of policy measures within their broader social inclusion policies. Some of them have chosen to revise their existing strategies in the light of the EU Framework, while others have developed their first national strategies. The national strategies vary according to the size of the Roma population and the challenges Member States need to address^{9.}

The Commission's assessment focuses on evaluating the Member States' approaches to the four key areas of education, employment, healthcare and housing, and on how structural requirements (cooperation with civil society, with regional and local authorities, monitoring, antidiscrimination and establishment of a national contact point) as well as funding are addressed. In each section, a summary table indicates the Member States that propose to put in place specific measures required by the EU Framework¹⁰. Member States that are not listed have not indicated such measures and need to address these specific issues, if relevant for their Roma population.

Based on the assessment, a set of policy recommendations in each section points to priorities that Member States should further address, depending on their national circumstances, in order to meet their responsibilities. These policy recommendations should be integrated in the overall framework to fight poverty and exclusion.

2.1. The four key areas

(a) Education

The EU's goal is to ensure that all Roma children complete at least primary school and have access to quality education¹¹.

All Member States recognise the importance of education, and most have set goals that generally go beyond the minimum standard of primary school completion set forth in the EU Framework, covering a broader spectrum of education from pre-school¹² to secondary and even tertiary education.

In accordance with national laws, all school-aged children in the EU must attend school. However, at least 10% of Roma children aged 7 to 15 in a number

of Member States were identified in a recent survey undertaken by the Fundamental Rights Agency as not attending school¹³. As it is a first step in acquiring basic skills, Member States should seek to increase attendance rates. In particular, in order to increase primary school attainment, Member States should enhance enrolment in early childhood education and care, the training of teachers and mediators, and the inclusion of Roma pupils in mainstream schools.

Measures aimed at reducing school-leaving in secondary education are planned in several Member States, while some Member States envisage increasing the participation of Roma students in tertiary education.

Measures to increase the educational attainment of children

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them ¹⁴
Endorsement of the general goal	BE, BG, CZ, DK, DE, EE, IE, EL, ES, IT, CY, LV, LT, LU, HU, AT, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, UK
Concrete goals to reduce education gap	BE, BG, CZ, EL, ES, IT, CY, LU, HU, AT, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, UK
Widening access to quality early childhood education and care	CZ, EL, ES, IT, CY, LV, HU, AT, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI
Measures to ensure that Roma children complete at least primary school	BE, BG, DE, EE, IE, EL, ES, FR, IT, LV, LU, HU, NL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK
Reducing secondary school leaving	BG, CZ, IE, EL, ES, FR, IT, HU, AT, PL, PT, RO, SK, FI, UK
Increasing tertiary education	CZ, ES, IT, HU, PT, FI
Measures aimed at preventing segregation	CZ, EL, ES, HU, PL, RO, SK
Support measures	BE, CZ, EE, IE, ES, IT, CY, LV, LT, HU, AT, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK

14 Member States are included if their respective strategies refer to the type of measures listed in the table.

Several Member States provide additional support measures, such as teaching and learning programmes in the Romani language, learning support programmes such as

after-school learning support or second-chance classes, parental education, including mediation, and raising awareness of the importance of education.

Examples of actions promoting Roma inclusion in education

While involving Roma assistants and mediators, **Slovenia** seeks to include Romani children as early as possible in educational processes (pre-schools). With better training quality of education providers and more support networks for learning, the completion rate for Romani children in general education will be significantly improved (in Ljubljana, 54.3% on average in secondary education against 18.7% for Roma). Moreover, attention is paid to the promotion of Roma culture and heritage.

Spain is setting up new mediation programmes to help reduce early school leaving and absenteeism (in primary education, the objective is to reduce it from 22.5% today to 15% by 2015 and to 10% by 2020).

The Kauhajoki model in **Finland** is based on three instructors with Roma background. A pre-school teacher provides support for the children and families participating in early childhood education; a special needs assistant provides support for comprehensive school pupils; and a case manager supports young adults in further studies and finding employment

- 15 In most Member States, the number of Roma saying they were unemployed was at least double than the number of non-Roma. In Italy, the Czech Republic and Slovakia up to 4 or even 5 times more Roma than non-Roma said they were unemployed (The situation of Roma in 11 EU Member States; Survey results at a glance. Fundamental Rights Agency, World Bank, United Nations Development Programme, 2012).
- Commission Recommendation 2008/867/EC on the active inclusion of people excluded from the labour market (OJ L 307/11 of 18/11/2008).
- ¹⁷ Specific measures aim to ensure non-discriminatory access for Roma to the labour market, including for example vocational and on-the-iob

In addition, support for the Roma culture and history in mainstream curricula is mentioned in a large number of

documents. In general, most strategies underline that a better understanding of culture is necessary to fight stereotypes.

As part of an integrated approach, Member States should, as a matter of priority in the area of education:

- eliminate school segregation and misuse of special needs education;
- enforce full compulsory education and promote vocational training;
- increase enrolment in early childhood education and care;
- · improve teacher training and school mediation;
- raise parents' awareness of the importance of education.

(b) Employment

The EU goal is to reduce the employment gap between Roma and the rest of the population¹⁵.

All Member States acknowledge the need to reduce the employment gap between Roma and non-Roma. To do so, an integrated approach needs to be encouraged in all Member States, particularly in those with a larger Roma population or where this gap is more significant. In addition, active inclusion policies¹⁶ should also reach out to the Roma. Moreover, in order to achieve tangible results, Member States need to

describe their objectives in terms of quantifiable targets supported by clear baseline data, so that progress can be monitored.

Notably in those Member States with a higher percentage of Roma, this population is largely located in rural areas. The strategy of these Member States should take this geographical distribution into consideration, identifying appropriate activities (both in the agricultural and non-agricultural sectors) in which Roma can participate, thus ensuring real opportunities for Roma employment.

Measures to increase labour market participation

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
Endorsement of the general goal	All Member States
Concrete goals to reduce the employment gap	BG, CZ, EL, ES, FR, HU, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI
General measures under the principle of equal treatment to reduce the employment gap	DK, DE, EE, IE, FR, CY, LV, LU, NL, AT, PL, SE
Additional or specific measures for Roma ¹⁷	BG, CZ, IE, ES, HU, AT, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE
Access to micro-credit Civil servants in the public sector Personalised services	IE, EL, ES, FR, IT, HU, PT, RO, SK, FI IE IE, IT, HU, PT, RO, FI, SE
Integrated approach	BG, CZ, ES, HU, SI, SK, FI, UK

Measures suggested in the EU Framework, such as providing access to micro-credit, employing qualified civil servants in the public sector and providing personalised services and mediation were addressed by only some Member States. Several Member States envisage other

specific measures to ensure non-discriminatory access for Roma to the labour market, including for example vocational and on-the-job training, or, facilitating access to childcare. Several Member States also plan measures in addition to those proposed in the EU Framework

Examples of actions promoting Roma inclusion in employment

Spain aims to increase the employment rate amongst the Roma population from 44% (in 2011) to 50% in 2015 and 60% in 2020, setting a specific objective for the employment of Roma women. The programmes will promote necessary skills and simultaneously facilitate access to ordinary training programmes for obtaining employment.

Austria promotes the access of young Roma from Austrian and immigrant communities to the labour market by the enhanced Thara project which includes community work, coaching and training. The previous Thara project (2011-2012) focused on access of national and immigrant Roma to employment, reaching out to 107 Roma and 56 participants from public administration and civil society. Building on its findings the current project aims more specifically at labour market integration including support for self-employment.

Bulgaria aims to raise the level of Roma in employment by 2015, primarily with ESF support, by organising training courses for more than 28 000 unemployed and employed Roma in order to raise their employability and qualifications and by training 1 500 people in management and entrepreneurship.

Increasing Roma participation in the labour market in the Member States with large Roma populations will bring

clear economic benefits, in particular in times of economic hardship.

As part of an integrated approach, Member States should, as a matter of priority, in the area of employment:

- provide tailored job search assistance and employment services;
- support transitional public work schemes combined with education as well as social enterprises employing Roma or providing them with specific services;
- · support a first work experience and on-the-job training;
- eliminate the barriers, including discrimination, to (re)enter the labour market, especially for women;
- provide stronger support for self-employment and entrepreneurship.

(c) Healthcare

The EU goal is to reduce the gap in the health status between the Roma and the rest of the population.

Although access to healthcare is universal in all Member States, in reality not all Roma can access these services to the same extent as the rest of the population. Most Member States are aiming to improve healthcare access for Roma through outreach and other methods. Some Member States included measures to reduce health inequalities between the Roma and non-Roma population

involving a range of preventive actions which go beyond those highlighted in the EU Framework. However, only few Member States defined a comprehensive approach to improve the health of Roma.

Several Member States have already put in place or are considering programmes involving qualified Roma as mediators for improving access to healthcare. These are very welcome initiatives. However, such measures need to be supplemented by other actions to have a significant impact on the health gap between Roma and the rest of the population.

18 These measures target preventive care, such as improving vaccination rates and campaigns on healthy lifestyles among Roma, but also reproductive health (e.g. prevention of youth pregnancies). Measures preventing prejudiced behaviour of health professionals are also mentioned by

With priority on reproductive health and preventive care including improved immunisation.

several Member States.

The need for a systematic, integrated approach to health has been identified as a key challenge. It requires coordination

between the healthcare sector and other sectors – particularly education, housing, employment and anti-discrimination.

Measures to improve healthcare

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
Endorsement of the general goal	BG, CZ, IE,, EL, ES, FR, IT, HU, RO, SI, SK, SE
Concrete goals to reduce the health gap	BG, CZ, IE, EL, ES, FR, IT, HU, RO, SI, SK
General measures relying on existing structures to reduce the health gap	DK, DE, EE, FR, CY, LV, LU, NL, AT, PL, PT, SE
Access to quality healthcare especially for children and women	EE, EL, ES, FR, IT, HU, PL, SK, SE
Additional measures ¹⁸	BE, BG, CZ, EE, ES, HU, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK

Several Member States highlight the need to focus on children's and women's health¹⁹. Some Member States

mention the importance of training health professionals to work with people of different socio-cultural backgrounds.

Examples of actions promoting Roma inclusion in healthcare

Hungary aims to train 2 000 Roma women with the help of the European Social Fund and ease the acquisition of practical experience in social, child welfare and child protection services, and also as family support social workers, community developers, employment facilitators and healthcare mediators.

Ireland has made available a wide range of Travellers-dedicated health services, such as the Traveller Health Units and the Primary Health Care Projects (including health mediators and public health nurses for Travellers). Since 1994, some Traveller women have been trained as community health mediators to develop primary healthcare based on Traveller communities' values.

In **Romania**, in order to increase the access of Roma people to public health services, the government employed approximately 450 health mediators by 2011. Their role is to facilitate the dialogue between the Roma and medical institutions and staff. They actively support Roma people in the process of obtaining identification documents, health insurances, registering on the lists of family doctors and make mothers aware of various health issues. Since this has represented a positive practice, one Roma inclusion goal is to increase the number of health mediators by 25% by 2020.

However, these commitments need to be bolstered by clear timelines for their implementation and by setting measurable targets so that progress can be followed. In addition, many Member States need to allocate clearer financial means to reduce health inequalities.

As part of an integrated approach, Member States should, as a matter of priority in the area of healthcare:

- extend health and basic social security coverage and services (also via addressing registration with local authorities);
- · improve the access of Roma, alongside other vulnerable groups, to basic, emergency and specialised services;
- launch awareness raising campaigns on regular medical checks, pre- and postnatal care, family planning and immunisation;
- ensure that preventive health measures reach out to Roma, in particular women and children;
- improve living conditions with focus on segregated settlements.

(d) Housing and essential services

The EU goal is to close the gap between the share of Roma with access to housing and to public utilities and that of the rest of the population.

Although all Member States agree with the need to improve the housing conditions of many Roma, few propose concrete measures as part of an integrated approach to tackle the situation. Independent measures that are not part of a comprehensive housing approach

including other accompanying measures in the fields of education, employment and healthcare may not achieve lasting results. Member States are therefore encouraged to consider broadening the scope of housing interventions, urban planning and rural development and making them part of such comprehensive plans. Some Member States, especially those with a relatively small Roma population, address the housing challenges of Roma within existing structures. Several Member States address access to housing, including social housing.

Measures to improve the housing situation

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
Endorsement of the general goal	All Member States (except LT)
Concrete goals to reduce gap in access to housing and public utilities	All Member States (except LT)
General measures relying on existing structures	DK, DE, EE, LV, LU, NL, AT, SE
Access to housing, including social housing	BG, CZ, DK,DE, IE, ES, IT, CY, HU, AT, PT, SI, SK, SE,
Addressing the needs of the non-sedentary population	BE, IE, FR, AT,UK
Integrated approach	CZ, ES, FR, HU, PT, RO, FI

Only a few Member States plan specific measures promoting non-discriminatory access to housing. Most Member States with Travellers include specific measures for non-sedentary populations. The in-

volvement of regional and local authorities as well as local Roma and non-Roma communities is essential for Member States in order to find sustainable solutions.

Examples of actions promoting Roma inclusion in housing

²⁰ Elements for a Common Strategic Framework 2014-2020, Staff Working Document (2012) 61 final, 14 March 2012.

In the **UK**, Welsh regional authorities have put in place specific measures to improve accommodation and access to services for Roma and Travellers. The funding made available to local authorities by the Welsh government to allow refurbishment and the creation of new sites has been increased from 75% to 100%.

In **Hungary**, to promote the social inclusion of those living in segregated environments, integrated programmes aimed at improving social, community, educational, healthcare, employment and housing conditions will be implemented using both ESF and ERDF resources. Alongside the establishment of community centres to provide hygienic and other services for the inhabitants, their housing needs will be targeted as well, including social housing.

In **France**, several local authorities have developed "insertion villages" in order to meet the needs of disadvantaged people, including Roma, who live in illegal settlements. Such projects will be replicated by other local authorities with the support of the European Regional Development Fund.

Considering the importance of the local level for housing issues, Member States are invited to promote community-led local development and integrated

territorial investments supported by the European Regional Development Fund, the European Social Fund and the Cohesion Fund²⁰.

As part of an integrated approach, Member States should, as a matter of priority in the area of housing:

- · promote desegregation;
- facilitate local integrated housing approaches with special attention to public utility and social service infrastructures;
- where applicable, improve the availability, affordability and quality of social housing and halting sites with access to affordable services as part of an integrated approach.

2.2. Assessment of the Structural Requirements

The EU Framework calls on Member States to pursue a targeted approach in line with the Common Basic Principles for Roma inclusion, and ensure consistency of their National Roma Integration Strategies with National Reform Programmes in the Europe 2020 framework.

(a) Mobilising the regional/local level civil society

The EU Framework highlighted the need for a continuous dialogue with regional and local authorities, as well as with Roma civil society in the design, implementation and monitoring of national strategies.

While most Member States highlight local projects or initiatives taken by local or regional authorities in order to promote Roma inclusion, only a few explicitly envisage the mobilisation of these authorities in implementing and monitoring of the strategies. Moreover, there is

little indication of the involvement or consultation of these local public actors in the drafting of the strategies. In very few cases, Member States do not indentify clear measures at national level, but concrete programmes are implemented at regional and local level.

As regards civil society, several Member States have conducted broad consultations with Roma representatives and civil society organisations in the design of their policy documents, although contributions received do not always seem to have been taken on board.

Mobilisation of regional and local authorities and civil society

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
Consultation of local and regional authorities or Roma/civil society representatives when drafting the strategy	BE, BG, DK, DE, EE, IE, ES, FR, IT, LV, HU, NL, AT,, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK
Planned involvement of regional and local authorities in implementation	BE, BG, CZ, DE, IE, EL, ES, FR, CY, LV, LT, AT, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK
Planned involvement of Roma/civil society representatives in implementation	BE, BG, DE, IE, EL, ES, FR, LV, HU, AT, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK

However, most Member States failed to explain how they see cooperation with regional and local authorities on the one hand, and civil society as well as Roma communities on the other, in the implementation and monitoring of their policies. Member States need to make more efforts to meaningfully involve both the regional and local authorities and civil society at all stages of the national strategies.

As part of an integrated approach, Member States should, as a matter of priority:

- closely involve, in accordance with their specific competences, regional and local authorities in the review, implementation and monitoring of the strategies;
- · involve civil society, including Roma organisations, in the implementation and monitoring of the strategies;
- · ensure coordination between the different layers of governance involved in the implementation of the strategies,
- mainstream Roma inclusion into the regional and local agenda;
- · make use of the European Social Fund to strengthen the capacity of Roma organisations.

(b) Effective monitoring and evaluation of policy implementation

The EU Framework calls on Member States to include in their strategies strong monitoring methods to evaluate the impact of Roma inclusion actions and a review mechanism for adapting strategies.

Several Member States recognise the need for a strong monitoring system and some are striving to put in place or at least are planning to develop such a system. Some Member States have successfully tested a territorial approach for monitoring the evolution of the situation, particularly in those areas where deprivation is more severe. However, substantial efforts are needed to meet the expectations set out in the EU Framework and to ensure appropriate reporting on Roma socio-economic inclusion in the framework of the Europe 2020 process, where appropriate.

Monitoring and implementation

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
Strong monitoring to evaluate impact	IE, LV, PT, SK
Review mechanism for adapting the strategy	BG, IE, EL, ES, LV, SK, FI, SE

21 Council Directive 2000/43/EC of 29 June 2000 implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of racial or ethnic origin (OJ L 180 of 19/7/2000); Framework Decision 2008/913/JHA of 28 November 2008 on combating certain forms and expressions of racism and xenophobia by means of criminal law (OJ L 328 of 6/12/2008).

As part of an integrated approach, Member States should:

- develop or make use of existing robust monitoring systems by setting a baseline, appropriate indicators and measureable targets in collaboration, where possible, with the National Statistical Offices;
- ensure that each programme makes provision for the assessment of its relevance, effectiveness,
 efficiency and impacts.

(c) Anti-discrimination and the protection of fundamental rights

The EU Framework calls on Member States to ensure that Roma are not discriminated against but treated like all other persons with equal access to all fundamental rights as enshrined in the EU Charter of Fundamental Rights.

All Member States paid attention to promoting antidiscrimination and to the protection of fundamental rights in their strategies. In most strategies, a specific section or chapter is dedicated to raising awareness of fundamental rights and fighting against discrimination or the violation of human rights (including addressing trafficking in human beings).

Measures to promote human rights and non-discrimination

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
Efforts in the field of human rights and non-discrimination	BE, BG, CZ, DK, DE, EE, IE, EL, ES, FR, IT, CY, LV, LT, LU, HU, NL, AT, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK, FI, SE, UK

Addressing the lack of registration of Roma in the national population registers and the lack of identity papers, where applicable, is an absolute pre-condition for ensuring equal access to public services. This should be urgently and properly addressed by those Member States where this is a challenge.

Stepping up the fight against discrimination and racism, including those forms affecting Roma people, must be part of a strong approach in each Member State. This should be based on full compliance with EU²¹ and national laws by all and on raising awareness of the societal interest of Roma integration. Opportunities for intercultural encounters may support such awareness and facilitate de-stigmatisation.

Roma children are a particularly vulnerable group when it comes to access to fundamental rights, which is only rarely addressed outside the fields of education and health. Several strategies devote specific attention to the situation of Roma women, even though additional efforts are needed to enable them to exercise their rights.

A significant number of the Roma living in the Member States are legally residing third-country nationals, who face the same challenges as migrants coming from outside the EU. They should not be discriminated against, but enjoy the same rights as those granted to non-EU migrants.

As part of an integrated approach, Member States should, as a matter of priority:

- ensure that all Roma are registered with the appropriate authorities;
- step up the fight against racism and discrimination including multiple discrimination;
- build public understanding of the common benefits of Roma inclusion;
- fight child labour and address trafficking in human beings more effectively, including by international cooperation.

(d) National contact points

The EU Framework asked Member States to appoint a national contact point for the National Roma Integration Strategy with the authority to coordinate the development and implementation of the strategy. All have followed this request and now have national contact points, most of them at a high level^{22.} The clear identification of the coordinating authorities in all 27 Member States is an improvement compared to the past and a strong indicator of the political will to tackle the challenges of Roma integration²³. At the same time close cooperation between national contact points and the authorities in charge of funding and responsible for the implementation must be ensured.

²² See the national contact points at :

http://ec.europa.eu/justice/ discrimination/roma/ national-strategies/index en.htm

- ²³ In Greece, appointment of the national contact point is foreseen for the second half of 2012.
- ²⁴ The European Commission is collaborating with the World Bank to develop a mapping methodology, as well as maps of poverty and exclusion for most of the Member States which joined the EU in or since 2004. In 2011, the European Spatial Planning Observation Network called for proposals aimed at developing maps of poverty and exclusion for a number of Member States that joined the EU before 2004. At the end of 2011, the European Commission proposed that in the next programming period, Member States present the contribution of their Partnership Contracts and operational programmes to combating poverty by focussing their efforts to specific geographical areas or target groups.

National contact points

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
Appoint a national contact point	All Member States

All measures should be put in place so that the inclusion policies effectively. national contact point is able to coordinate Roma

2.3. Assessment of the funding of measures

The EU Framework asked Member States to allocate sufficient funding from national budgets, to be complemented, where appropriate, by EU and international funding, to Roma inclusion measures. The assessment of the national strategies shows that most Member States have failed to allocate sufficient budgetary resources for Roma inclusion. Just a few Member States have identified budgetary resources and concrete amounts for Roma inclusion policy measures.

To ensure the implementation of Roma inclusion policies, several Member States plan to rely mostly on EU funding, especially on the European Social Fund and the European Regional Development Fund. Although possibilities exist to support vulnerable groups, such as Roma, within the scope of the rural development policy, most strategies do not make any reference to the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD). Budgetary allocations for National Roma Integration Strategies should follow a territorial approach addressing the specific needs of geographical areas most affected by poverty or target groups at highest risk of discrimination or exclusion, with special regard to marginalised communities such as the Roma²⁴.

Allocation of funding

Measures required by the EU Framework	Member States that have addressed them
No indication of funding	IE, FR, CY, LU, NL, AT, FI, UK
No budget allocations	BE, DK, DE, EE, ES
Indication of allocation of funding from national budgets	BG, EL, LV, LT, HU, PL, RO, SI, SK, SE
Indication of allocation of international/ EU funding	CZ, EL, LV, LT, HU, PL, PT, RO, SI, SK

Member States should make more and better use of EU
their absorption rate. Funds for Roma inclusion as part of their efforts to improve

In order to ensure the sustainable implementation of their Roma inclusion strategies, Member States should show a clear commitment to securing their financing up to 2020, thereby reflecting their political will to address Roma exclusion.

The challenges of enlargement countries

The EU Framework underlines that the EU Roma integration goals are equally relevant to enlargement countries. The National Roma Integration Strategies of these countries need to be reviewed in line with these goals and reflect the comprehensive approach required by the EU Framework. This is clearly highlighted in the Commission Enlargement Strategy and Main Challenges 2011-2012²⁵.

The Commission is closely following developments in its annual progress reports. In addition to focusing on the four key areas of the EU Framework, countries in the Western Balkans and Turkey need to pay particular attention to facilitating access to personal documents and registration with the local authorities²⁶. The national authorities of enlargement countries need to remain committed to taking concrete steps in all related areas²⁷.

A number of measures are already funded in candidate countries under the human resources development component of the Instrument on Pre-Accession Assistance (IPA). Beneficiary countries have a section dedicated to vulnerable groups and Roma in their Operational Programme, which promotes social inclusion, including training, career guidance and activities to improve participation in the job market.

In order to further assist the enlargement countries in their efforts to promote Roma inclusion, the Commission has taken steps to improve the use of IPA in order to address Roma inclusion at national and regional level in a more strategic and result-oriented way²⁸.

Better integration of Roma is a matter of social justice and of ensuring more inclusive societies in the enlargement countries. This forms part of the EU's shared values that enlargement countries are encouraged to embrace as part of the path to accession. However, the current situation of Roma living in poor conditions in enlargement countries has had consequences in terms of the increased number of Roma temporarily migrating to EU Member States under visa-free regime and even applying for asylum²⁹. This can have a negative impact on the visa liberalisation, which is one of the greatest achievements towards the integration of the Western Balkans into the EU. Enlargement countries must step up efforts to further integrate their Roma citizens. This should also include sustainable solutions for refugees and internally displaced persons, many of whom are Roma³⁰.

- ²⁵ COM (2011) 666.
- ²⁶ Zagreb Declaration of 27 October 2011, approved at the Conference on the Provision of Civil Status Documentation and Registration in South Eastern Europe.
- ²⁷ This commitment includes: establishing or reviewing relevant general and specific action plans and programmes in the four key areas, facilitating access to personal documents and registration: fostering early childhood education and reducing Roma early school leaving: stimulating employment of Roma in the public and private sector: preventing discrimination in social and health care, and improving the housing conditions of Roma, particularly those living in informal settlements.
- Implementation is monitored through the mechanism of the Stabilisation and Association (SAA) process and the annual progress reports; the operational conclusions will be followed-up in 2012 in SAA committee meetings.
- ²⁹ SEC(2011) 695 and SEC(2011) 1570.
- The Sarajevo process
 (Belgrade Declaration of 7
 November 2011) includes a
 €584 million Joint Regional
 Programme on this issue.

4. The way forward

The Commission's assessment of the National Roma Integration Strategies shows that Member States are making efforts to develop a comprehensive approach towards Roma integration. However, much more needs to be done at national level. Socio-economic inclusion of Roma remains first and foremost the responsibility of the Member States and they will need stronger efforts to live up to their responsibilities, by adopting more concrete measures, explicit targets for measurable deliverables, clearly earmarked funding at national level and a sound national monitoring and evaluation system.

To meet the challenges identified and to bring about the effective integration of Roma minorities, Member States, especially those with a sizeable Roma population, need in particular to:

Continue regular bilateral dialogue with the Commission and relevant stakeholders in order to

- ensure that National Strategies and action plans are coherent with EU laws and policies and with the specific national situation, including mainstream policies and public sector reforms, and take into account the impacts of the economic crisis;
- ensure effective use of both national and European funds;
- promote and monitor concrete implementation of the strategies.

• Involve regional and local authorities

Member States need to ensure that the implementation of the strategies is coherent with regional and local plans. Regional and local authorities are indispensable for delivering change and need to be fully on board when the strategies are reviewed and implemented. In addition, the Commission will further promote exchanges of experience and networking among regional and local authorities.

• Work closely with civil society

Civil society, and in particular Roma organisations, should

not be considered as passive recipients of change, but should be called upon to play an active role in generating it. They must play a crucial role in bringing Roma people on board and in building trust between majorities and minorities. Member States must take the necessary measures to secure the participation of civil society in the review, implementation and monitoring of their national strategies.

• Allocate proportionate financial resources

Member States need to allocate sufficient resources for the implementation of National Roma Integration Strategies, as this reflects Member States' ambitions. In addition to national funding, actions included in these strategies will also form part of the Structural Funds and the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development negotiations for the 2014-2020 programming period. The Cohesion Policy Framework proposed by the Commission includes a minimum allocation for social inclusion and poverty, improved access to funds and their better coordination and integration, and an investment priority dedicated to the integration of marginalised communities such as the Roma and ex-ante conditionality requirements making Structural Funds investments conditional upon the existence of a National Roma Integration Strategy in line with the EU Framework.

Monitor transformation and enable policy adjustment

National Reform Programmes within the European semester will be scrutinised for coherence with National Roma Integration Strategies and, where appropriate, references to Roma integration will be made in the Country-Specific Recommendations, in order to guide the relevant Member States towards further progress. In future years, in proportion to their Roma populations, Member States are asked to systematically address the issue of Roma inclusion in their National Reform Programmes.

Furthermore, the accompanying Staff Working Document to this communication includes the summary of key points which help the Member States to bridge the gaps between Roma people and the majority population. The detailed assessment will be shared with the Member States in the context of dialogue with them.

Member States are also invited to share with the Commission the findings of their monitoring of the implementation of their respective strategies.

The EU's Fundamental Rights Agency will continue its surveys across the EU and work closely with the Member States to support them in developing robust national monitoring systems.

The Commission will continue to support mobilising capacity within Member States. To this end, a network of the national contact points of all EU Member States will be set up to share the results of their measures addressing Roma inclusion, exchange best practices and peerreview the implementation of their strategies. The European Platform for Roma Inclusion will continue to provide a forum for stakeholders to exchange views.

The Commission will review annually the implementation of the National Roma Integration Strategies, reporting to the European Parliament and the Council, as well as under the framework of the Europe 2020 Strategy.

• Fight discrimination convincingly

Member States need to ensure that anti-discrimination legislation is effectively enforced in their territories. When reporting in 2013 on the application of the EU's Race Equality Directive³¹, the Commission will address legal issues with a particular emphasis on those aspects relevant to Roma integration.

31 Council Directive 2000/43/EC of 29 June 2000 implementing the principle of equal treatment between persons irrespective of racial or ethnic origin (OJ L 180 of 19/7/2000).

Commission staff working document accompanying the document

National Roma Integration Strategies: a first step in the implementation of the EU Framework

Communication from the Commission to the European Parliament, the Council, the European Economic and Social Commitee and the Committee of the Regions

${f 1}$. Introduction

All EU Member States were expected to develop or update their national strategies according to their different starting points and to the size of Roma population¹ living on their territories, in line with the requirements laid down in the EU Framework.

In its assessment the Commission relied on the information provided in the strategies and focused on the specific issues highlighted in the EU Framework under the four key priority areas. As the aim of the EU Framework is to bring about a change in the approach to Roma inclusion from scattered, project-based and unrelated interventions to a comprehensive approach embracing all four key areas through an integrated and coordinated effort, the assessment also examined whether such

strategic thinking could be seen in the strategies.

In addition, the assessment also covers the structural requirements specified in the EU Framework, including the involvement of all important national stakeholders, the creation of a robust monitoring system, the appointment of a national contact point, ensuring the protection of fundamental rights and monitoring. Particular attention was also paid to the use of EU funding and more generally of resources secured so as to ensure the effective and sustainable implementation of the strategies.

The subsequent country specific summaries highlight the key elements and the gaps identified by the Commission's assessment for each Member State's strategy.

1 The term "Roma" is used here, as well as by a number of international organisations and representatives of Roma groups in Europe, to refer to a number of different groups (such as Roma, Sinti, Kale, Gypsies, Romanichels, Boyash, Ashkali, Egyptians, Yenish, Dom, Lom) and also includes Travellers, without denying the specificities and varieties of lifestyles and situations of these groups.

Key points from the commission's assessment of the 27 national Roma integration strategies

2.1. Belgium

Document sent to the Commission on:		6 March 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	30 000 Roma; 9 250 Travellers
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 30 000 i.e. 0.29 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Principle of equal and non-discriminatory access to education. Provision of education to every child and young person (6-18 years old) from the Roma community, independently of his/her status, which corresponds to the full enforcement of compulsory primary education in compliance to national law.	The action plan requires more information on the order of magnitude, indicators, monitoring and funding at the different levels of implementation.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Measures targeted at intermediaries dedicated to train, improve knowledge and collect information for welfare services. Data collection. Pilot project: "from migrants to middle class" (Brussels)	Indicators and data (e.g. clear description of the baseline etc.) as well as clear earmarking of financial means should be added in order to enable monitoring and assessing whether the actions meet the objectives. Attention should also be paid to the gender issue.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Ensuring Roma have accessible, quality and sustainable healthcare services, mainly using existing services. Pilot project focused upon the provision of healthcare services to Roma patients in the area of Sint-Niklaas.	Further work is needed to clarify goals, how progress will be evaluated and to develop an action plan with detailed measures.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Housing policy (for Roma and other target groups) aiming at increasing the availability of good and appropriate housing, for an accessible price. Development of halting sites by the Flemish authorities to use as caravan camps by the local authorities or social housing agencies.	Cohesion policy financial instruments could contribute to social housing in the framework of an integrated approach. Local plans should also be taken into account by the strategy, particularly those plans implemented through urban type of interventions.
Structural requirements and funding	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: A "Council for the Roma and the Travellers" will be established by the federal government. A special "Roma Helpdesk" will be established within the federal ministry for social integration Implementation of the national strategy will be monitored on an annual basis through a working group/committee gathering representatives of the various instances.	Details on the funding of the proposed action plans by the different decision-making levels should be included. Monitoring and evaluation mechanisms should be specified in the strategy.

2.2. Bulgaria

Document sent to the Commission on:		24 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	325 343 (January 2011 census), i.e. 4.9% of the population
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 750 000 i.e. 10.33 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: School dropout correctly identified as a key problem that needs to be addressed. Focal and whole day schools, where children receive a meal and extracurricular activities. Training of teachers on multiculturalism. Measures to step up parental involvement	Segregation in primary and secondary education could have been more appropriately addressed. More attention should be paid to higher education. Indicators are mentioned, but goals are not quantified. The scope of the envisaged intervention is limited by the planned funding. Monitoring and data collection on the share of Roma within overall early school leavers would be necessary.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Training courses for the unemployed, for labour office staff on the Roma, on entrepreneurship and management. Subsidised employment for vulnerable groups. Appointment of Roma representatives in the employment agencies in regions with predominant Roma population.	More measures to improve Roma employment in rural areas could have been envisaged. Effectiveness of public works programmes to provide (re)qualification and lead to sustainable employment should be examined. Appropriate funding (both national and EU should be indicated.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Focus on increase of qualified Roma in the healthcare system, promotion of health mediators and mobile health units. Family planning support. Immunisation campaigns. Information campaigns. Training and informing health professionals on the Roma culture.	The lack of health insurance coverage is a key problem for a large percentage of the Roma population and needs to be addressed in more detail. Other further work should include development of preventive services including immunisation, creating healthy living conditions via an integrated approach including social assistance. More work is needed on information systems to monitor health needs and health outcomes of Roma. Registration with public authorities is necessary.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Pilot initiative for building new social housing in four Bulgarian municipalities, launched under the operational programme for regional development. Understanding of the existing problems, willingness to solve them and interest for Roma inclusion from local authorities.	The quantification of the scope of actions should be developed and be supported by appropriate funding. Municipalities are expected to make needs assessments and prepare action plans for the improvement of the housing conditions of Roma, but no measure is specified in order to ensure deliver. Desegregation in housing should be addressed along with desegregation in education and labour market integration.
Structural requirements and funding	The strategy acknowledges the key role of municipalities in the implementation: municipalities will have to adopt annual action plans for implementing the activities planned in the strategy. Further consultation with respective bodies implementing the Action Plan is foreseen. The consultation and dialogue with civil society organisations on the preparation of the strategy was of high quality.	A territorial approach to Roma integration could be particularly relevant, in to the light of the uneven spread of the Roma population on the territory and the fact that local authorities have the competence for a number of social support measures. Appropriate funding for local authorities needs to be ensured. In the light of the considerable reliance on Structural Funds to support projects addressing the identified priorities, a significant improvement of the absorption capacity should be a priority. The strategy does not make reference to any pote ntial contribution of the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD).

2.3. Czech Republic

Document sent to the Commission on:		19 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 150 000 - 200 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 250 000 i.e. 1.93 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Increasing accessibility to pre-school education and early care services in socially excluded Roma localities. Improving the process of diagnosing the special educational needs of Roma pupils. Supporting teaching assistants. Supporting Roma children from elementary schools when transferring to the secondary and tertiary education systems. Full day schools. Life-long-learning on key skills and literacy. Developing models for inclusive education.	More concrete targets and corresponding measures are needed on how to tackle segregation of Roma children in the educational system. An integrated approach is also necessary.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Reform of public employment services in favour of disadvantaged Roma job applicants. Building the capacity of social services providers in socially excluded Roma localities. Supporting social businesses. Offering requalification courses and individual professional counselling on starting up a business. Fighting against illegal employment. Building financial literacy of Roma in socially excluded Roma localities.	Developing more concrete measures in the area of social economy and integration into open labour market would be needed. Reform of the public employment service should be complemented by accessible and targeted social services of high quality. Support for self-employment of Roma by microcredit schemes would be beneficial. Focus on effective grant policy for implementing the measures would be relevant.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Includes support for a programme of health social assistants in socially excluded Roma localities. Improving the communication between the members of Roma communities and the medical personnel. Awareness raising on health and healthy lifestyle.	The strategy could be significantly improved through further measures to address accessibility of healthcare, preventive care and social services; the inclusion of measurable targets; a clearer timeframe for implementation; a clearer financial allocation and information systems to monitor health needs and health outcomes of Roma.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Revitalisation of socially excluded Roma localities via integrated urban development plans. Increase access to social housing for Roma households with low incomes. Reduction of the incidence of discrimination and unlawful practices applied to Roma in the housing market. Prevention of the loss of accommodation by socially excluded members of Roma communities as a result of rental arrears.	The strategy could be further improved by concrete measures to provide non-discriminatory access to housing, including good quality social housing. The implementation of measures should be underpinned by legal steps in the area of protection of Roma households against unlawful practices in the property market.
Structural requirements and funding	All goals fit the national context. Special attention is also paid to indebtedness and security of Roma as well as culture and language. The cooperation between the central government and regional authorities is foreseen.	The strategy would be more precise with a detailed description of the timeframe, monitoring and evaluation system. The sustainability of EU funded measures requires further attention. Specific attention should also be devoted to an integrated approach and cooperation and involvement of civil society.

2.4. Denmark

Document sent to the Commission on:		30 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 2 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 5 500 i.e. 0.10 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: In general terms, acknowledgement of the importance of education for the integration of disadvantaged groups, such as the Roma. Identification of lower educational achievements and school drop-out as the main challenges for Roma people. Recognition of lessons learnt from previous local experiences.	Key problems of school absenteeism, integration into mainstream classes and language barriers are well identified. Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Focus on the local level and recognition of lessons learnt from previous past experiences. Acknowledgement of the possible language barriers.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Health	The system in place is designed to respond to health needs of persons in disadvantaged situations, including the Roma.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Housing	All those legally residing in Denmark have equal access to a large social housing sector and to financial support for rent.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Structural requirements and funding	Stakeholders have been consulted on the preparation of the strategy and the fact that a continuous dialogue with stakeholders will be relevant for the next steps is acknowledged. A strong attention is put to the efforts needed at the municipal level and dissemination of knowledge and best practices at the local level is foreseen.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary for a robust monitoring. Stronger cooperation and support to the local actors would be necessary.

2.5. Germany

Document sent to the Commission on:		23 December 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 70 000 (including only German Sinti and Roma, not other EU or non-EU nationals)
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 105 000 i.e. 0.13 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: A basic right to education, on the basis of the principle of equal treatment ensures non-discriminatory access to education to all, including Sinti and Roma. Programmes improving the integration of disadvantaged groups within the education system. Sinti and Roma have access to the programmes offered on a non-discriminatory basis. General measures supporting individual learning available to all pupils, in some Länder targeted specific support (at project level) for Sinti and Roma.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Sinti and Roma people is necessary.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Support under the general worker-focussed integration concept available to all Sinti and Roma (including profiling focussing on the individual's strengths and potential, objective setting, strategy development and implementation/follow-up). Problem-oriented, tailored support measures at Land level.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Sinti and Roma is necessary
Health	Access to healthcare and prevention services is available to all ensured people (provision of healthcare conditioned to the obligation to be registered within a health insurance scheme). In accordance with the Asylum Seeker Benefits Act healthcare and prevention services are available to foreign Roma with the status of 'tolerated persons' on account of their special residence status. Specific advice centres are available for Sinti and Roma in several Länder, funded partly by the Länder, to facilitate the access to health care and other services.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Sinti and Roma is necessary.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: No differentiation in housing provisions on the basis of ethnic origin. Particular attention paid to the needs of Sinti and Roma in some towns and cities in the context of housing and \urban development policy. Social housing support provided to all disadvantaged, including Sinti and Roma, regardless of nationality or ethnic origin.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the specific situation of Sinti and Roma is necessary. The opportunity offered by the cohesion policy instruments concerning social housing in the framework of an integrated approach should be considered.
Structural requirements and funding	Civil society organisations were consulted in the design of the strategy. Monitoring is established in the context of the Council of Europe's Framework Convention on the Protection of National Minorities (FCNM), the European Commission against Racism and Intolerance (ECRI) and the Committee against the Discrimination of Races (CERD), but not at national level.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the specific situation of Sinti and Roma requires a robust monitoring at national level.

2.6. Estonia

Document sent to the Commission on:		22 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 600-1 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 1 250 i.e. 0.10 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Exchanges of best practices among schools. In-service training of school staff on Roma culture. Support to learning the Romani language.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma is necessary.
Employment	Measures are included within the mainstream political frame. Roma have the right to access labour market services and benefits as all other permanent resident in Estonia.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma is necessary.
Health	A link has been established between the socio-economic situation of Roma and their access to healthcare.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma is necessary.
Housing	The main responsibility lies in the hand of local authorities.	Support measures to local authorities in the planning and delivery of social housing interventions, as part of an integrated approach, would be needed.
Structural requirements and funding	The strategy refers to nine Roma associations and cooperation and active dialogue are ongoing with some of the local associations.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.

2.7. Ireland

Document sent to the Commission on:		31 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 22 435 Travellers and 3 000 Roma
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 37 500 i.e. 0.90 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Strong existing approach of intercultural education, where the specific needs of Travellers and Roma are dealt with on same basis as of needs of all other students. Some local examples of support to Roma adult education and Roma mediators. Specific and sizeable funding allocated in 2008, 2009 and 2010 for the education of the Traveller community.	The approach should be integrated with interventions in other sectors. Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget will secure the implementation of the strategy. It would be important to address the issue of early school leaving
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Local initiatives to enhance employment and enterprise support to Travellers. Provisions for an internship programme in the Civil service.	Scaling up initiatives, detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Considerable work undertaken in the area of Traveller health. A wide range of specific Traveller-dedicated health services. Strong dialogue mechanisms between Ministry of Health or health services and Travellers. Analysis of health situation of travellers well described in "All Ireland Traveller Health Study".	The specific situation and challenges met by Roma regarding health should be better described.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: 2009-2013 Traveller accommodation programme adopted by local authorities that defines annual targets and foresees annual reports. Traveller accommodation consultative committees both at local and national levels.	A long-term approach is missing.
Structural requirements and funding	The role of local and regional authorities is very much high-lighted in the implementation of measures, especially in the housing sector. The monitoring system is detailed for each policy areas.	Measures to improve the consultation and political engagement of Roma and Travellers would be needed. A planning with financial resources for incoming years should be included.

2.8. Greece

Document sent to the Commission on:		30 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 50 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 265 000 i.e. 2.47 % of the population
Approach		National strategy.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Reduction of early drop outs at all levels of education; reduction of adult illiteracy. Supporting participation of Roma in pre-school education. Systemic monitoring of enrolment and attendance of Roma children in all compulsory education. Providing information on children's rights.	Focus on desegregation and applying an integrated approach would be necessary. There is also need to enforce full compulsory education, strengthen learning support and fight prejudices.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Employment	Local targeted actions promote employment and business activities in line with the assessment of local needs.	An integrated approach is necessary to address the issue of Roma employment. Further locally focused interventions and tailor-made support are necessary. A combination of training and work experience should be favoured in line with general measures to fight youth unemployment.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements Improving accessibility of Roma to the national healthcare system and to preventive primary healthcare. Improving the health of Roma women and children. Commitment made to ensure adequate housing including good sanitary conditions which are linked with health status.	Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, budget and monitoring are needed to secure the efficient implementation of the strategy.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Making use of ERDF for housing interventions. Resettlement of Roma living in illegal settlements. Ensuring minimum satisfactory living conditions.	Concrete measures to provide non-discriminatory access to housing are needed. Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, budget and monitoring are needed to secure the efficient implementation of the strategy
Structural requirements and funding	The description of challenges under each policy area is rather brief, but accurate and corresponds to the national context. The cooperation with regional and local authorities is foreseen in the future. The necessity for a strong monitoring system was recognized and such a system is currently designed.	Roma civil society should be meaningfully involved in the process of Roma inclusion. Specific attention should be devoted to most disadvantaged regions. Mainstream policies should also cater for the specific needs of the Roma. There is no specific reference to the use of EAFRD or to rural areas. However, opportunities for the Roma population in rural areas could be further enhanced by the Greek Rural Development Programme.

2.9. Spain

Document sent to the Commission on:		2 March 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 750 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 725 000, i.e. 1.57% of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The sound strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Overall accurate depiction (supported by data) of the problems faced by Roma communities which inspire ambitious policies. Goal of increasing the proportion of Roma girls and boys that have attended pre-school prior to their compulsory schooling and increasing school completion of Roma girls and boys in primary education. Reduction of absenteeism in primary education and of early school leavers prior to 16. Increase of completion of compulsory secondary education and increase in academic success of Roma pupils. Reduction of illiteracy.	Difficulties of defining adapted and relevant indicators are acknowledged and addressed as problems to be solved.
Employment	The sound strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Comprehensive strategy for improvement of Roma health and reduction of social inequalities in healthcare through interventions in the adult population and among children. Reorientation of health services to reduce health inequalities. Clear, achievable targets and timelines set up on very concrete situations (i.e. traffic accidents, obesity, smoking etc. with a specific focus on Roma women. Focus on health of Roma immigrants. Comprehensive Action Plan for the development of the Roma population in place with focus on improving health of Roma.	Employment measures should be reinforced by allocation of funding. Measures targeting in particular young Roma should be a priority.
Health	The sound strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Comprehensive strategy for improvement of Roma health and reduction of social inequalities in healthcare through interventions in the adult population and among children. Reorientation of health services to reduce health inequalities. Clear, achievable targets and timelines set up on very concrete situations (i.e. traffic accidents, obesity, smoking etc. with a specific focus on Roma women. Focus on health of Roma immigrants. Comprehensive Action Plan for the development of the Roma population in place with focus on improving health of Roma.	The strategy could be further improved in respect of the financial allocations.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Housing	Clear short and mid terms reachable objectives, mainly on two aspects: eradication of slums and sub-standard housing; improvement of accommodation quality for Roma.	Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, budget and monitoring are needed to secure the efficient implementation of the strategy. The use of the structural funds to support the planning and implementation of social housing should be considered.
Structural requirements and funding	Consultation on the strategy has taken place at horizontal level with the relevant Ministries and with autonomous communities, the Federation of Municipalities and Provinces, and civil society organisations. Strong political will to further improve collaboration among the various decision-making levels, especially as regards a coordinated effort to make better use of EU Funds. Balance between universal and targeted policies and the reliance on mid- and long-term indicators and goals. Boosting the use of the ERDF in accordance with the possibilities offered by Article 7.2 of its regulations (reconstruction of housing and eradication of segregated settlements). The involvement of social agents and partners (Roma organizations and the Social Third Sector) is foreseen.	The strategy should better identify funding including from structural funds and from the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD).

2.10. France

Document sent to the Commission on:		8 February 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	(no estimate)
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 400 000 i.e. 0.21 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Principle of equal and non-discriminatory access to education. Innovative pilot programs to fight against early school drop-out and promote secondary education of disadvantaged pupils. Attempts to respond to the needs of traveller children (coordinator in charge of bringing together the various services, mobile schools, distant learning).	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Travellers and Roma is necessary. Actions in early childhood education could be intensified using also experiences from pilot programs. Better integration of the regular school system with distance learning could improve the effectiveness of the measures.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Fight against long-term unemployment in the scope of general measures, not targeted at the Roma. Support to Association pour le Droit à l'Initiative Economique in order to develop its action on microcredit to Travellers.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Travellers and Roma is necessary.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Support to NGOs working at local level on mediation and raising awareness programmes. Regional programme giving access to health care (including the preventive healthcare) for disadvantage groups, targeting women and children in particular.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Travellers and Roma is necessary. Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget is needed to secure the efficient implementation of the strategy.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Presented measures are building on existing solid legal basis (Droit au Logement Opposable, Law of 31 May 2011, Law of 5 July 2000, etc.). Specific measures addressed the needs of travellers but no real national strategy concerning migrant Roma (mainly local initiatives). Acknowledgement that an integrated approach is needed. Strong mobilisation of local actors.	Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget is needed to secure the implementation of the strategy. Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Travellers and Roma is necessary.
Structural requirements and funding	Consultation of civil society and local authorities via the Conseil National des politiques de lutte contre la pauvreté et l'exclusion sociale and the Commission Nationale Consultative des Gens du Voyage. Reinforcement of fundamental rights (fighting human trafficking, combating discrimination) is taken into consideration within an individual chapter.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Travellers and Roma requires a robust monitoring. Stronger cooperation with the local actors and the civil society is recommended.

2.11. Italy

Document sent to the Commission on:		29 February 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 130 000 – 150 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 140 000 i.e. 0.23% of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Goal to ensure education to all Roma children, promote non-discriminatory access to education and tackle early school leaving of Roma. Incentive (e.g. scholarships) to improve participation of Roma in higher education. Support to cooperation between educational institutions, extra-school services and Roma communities and families. Some measures focused on the education of young mothers (completion of compulsory education).	The goals are ambitious and realistic. The proposed measures should be reinforced with precise quantitative targets and identification of the necessary resources.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Non-discriminatory access to training courses. Develop the micro-credit actions through the use of ESF. Monitor the situation of the undeclared work. Reinforce the efficiency of the local Public Employment Services. Promotion of the self-employment. Support the transition from school to work helping directly Roma families, promote active labour policies to include Roma women in the labour market.	The proposed measures are lacking precise quantitative targets and quantification of necessary resources. The lack of figures and indicators will make it difficult to monitor.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Reinforcement of existing projects aimed to monitor the health situation of Roma. A vaccination campaign will be developed for Roma families. Further and stronger health monitoring for women. Inclusion of qualified Roma in social services and medical programmes.	The proposed measures should be reinforced by precise quantitative targets, quantification of necessary resources and setting up concrete timeframes.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Development of local policies to provide safe housing to Roma communities, build new accommodations for disadvantaged groups, promote micro-credit, monitor social housing measures, etc. The financial framework presented is based on EU structural funds and resources provided at national, regional and local level. Clear and strong position against the "system of camps" (recognised as an unsuitable arrangement in terms of desegregation and social exclusion).	The quantification of financial resources is difficult to determine as there are no quantitative targets for future actions.
Structural requirements and funding	The strategy shows efforts to solve the legal status of Roma from the Balkans and to recognise Roma, Sinti and Caminanti as ethnic minorities. Pilot projects have been ongoing in 2012-2013 in some key regions to test the whole new governance system in view of replicating/adapting it in 2014-2020 to other regions. National representatives of Roma communities, the national conference of regions, the national associations of sub-regional authorities (i.e. provinces and municipalities) and a number of relevant ministries participated in the preparation of the strategy.	Identification of quantitative targets, indicators, and funding should be further developed. This process is left to working groups that should develop these aspects in 2012-2013. A robust monitoring and evaluation methodology would further improve the strategy.

2.12. Cyprus

Document sent to the Commission on:		25 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 650 - 700 (government controlled area)
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 1 250 i.e. 0.16% of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Free and accessible education to all. Compulsory primary and secondary education, provided free of charge by the Government. Additional funding for schools in Zones of Educational Priority. Bilingual teachers to facilitate communication between teachers, pupils and parents. Breakfast and lunch provided to all pupils in need.	The impact of policies should be monitored.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Free access to the labour market, equal to that of all Cypriot citizens and support by the Public Employment Services in finding employment. Promotion of educational language programmes for non-Greek speaking adults by the Ministry of Education & Culture and by multifunctional centres operated by the Municipalities of Limassol and Nicosia.	The impact of policies should be monitored.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Access to public healthcare provided to all, regardless their residence or legal status, and guaranteed by law. Reduced fees of free healthcare provided for disadvantaged groups (based on criteria such as family income, employment status and residential status).	The impact of policies should be monitored.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Repairs/improvements to 20 Turkish-Cypriot houses inhabited by Roma in Limassol district and to 25 Turkish-Cypriot houses in Paphos district. Two housing projects for Cypriot Roma (16 and 24 prefabricated housing units).	

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Structural requirements and funding	Involvement to some extent of local authorities, professionals (e.g. teachers) and civil society organisations.	More attention should be paid to involving all stake-holders.

2.13. Latvia

Document sent to the Commission on:		14 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	8 517 Roma people in July 2011
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 14 500 i.e. 0.65 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: The policy document sets the goal for "an effective system in place for the inclusion of Roma children in general education schools" by 2018. Combination of mainstreamed and targeted measures. Roma mediators. Teacher support. Education seminars for Roma families. Exchanges of good practice. Good description of the situation of Roma people.	More attention to early childhood education, and adult education would have been relevant. Data used in the strategy should be updated.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Emphasis on research in order to support evidence-based policies. Promotion of dialogue between Roma, NGOs and employers. Support for groups at risk of social exclusion.	The local and regional authorities should be involved. Measures should be foreseen to facilitate registered self-employment of the Roma. Data used in the strategy should be updated.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Health	Research foreseen in order to collect data to support evidence-based policies.	Data used in the strategy should be updated. Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Presentation of information on the basis of various sources on the housing situation of Roma people. Forthcoming study on the socio-economic situation of Roma people in Latvia, followed by a foreseen reflection on the need to amend the existing legislation regulating housing assistance to Roma people. Foreseen training within the local authorities dealing with Roma people on housing issues.	The involvement of local authorities should be strengthened, in particular in relation to social housing. Data used in the strategy should be updated
Structural requirements and funding	Local and regional authorities have been consulted and follow-up activities (seminars, network of regional coordinators) are foreseen to maintain dialogue with stakeholders. Civil society has been consulted and public debates have taken place in the drafting phase. Strengthening the civil society capacity is foreseen. A dynamic monitoring mechanism is planned including a consultative board for the coordination of the implementation and regular reports and surveys. Measures to fight against discrimination and support Roma culture are indicated.	Clearer allocation of funding would further improve the strategy.

2.14 . Lithuania

Document sent to the Commission on:		21 March 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	(no estimate)
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 3 000 i.e. 0.08 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Non-formal education/cultural activities for Roma children. Educational activities for Roma children in the Roma community centre. Foreseen research in order to get sound picture of the integration of Roma into the educational system. Adult education measures for Roma. Roma mediators. Language and IT courses for Roma. Teacher training and teaching material on Roma history and culture.	There is no plan beyond 2014. Attention to early child-hood education should be addressed
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Disseminate information about active labour market policy measures. Projects supported by EU structural funds assisting Roma getting integrated in the labour market.	There is no plan beyond 2014. As Roma women are recognised as particularly vulnerable, specific attention to them should be paid.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: One event on healthy lifestyle organised in Vilnius. Training for Roma women and girls on hygiene.	There is no specific goal in the health sector and no plan beyond 2014. The specific situation and challenges met by Roma in health are not described, e.g. as regards access to health insurance. Foreseen measures are pilot initiatives only.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Housing		The situation of Roma in housing is not described although census data are available. The effective access to housing of Roma should be monitored, in order to make sure that their needs are met.
Structural requirements and funding	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Activities to raise awareness of Roma on their rights and promote tolerance and increase intercultural dialogue. Measures to promote Roma culture (events, Children Day Centres, research on and support of Roma history and folklore). The submitted strategy contains a sound action plan, detailing a calendar and funding (amounts and sources). Quantified indicators to monitor progress on the goals are fixed. The intergovernmental working group established under the Ministry of culture is responsible for monitoring process. Responsibilities of implementation are clearly divided among the relevant ministries and institutions.	Stronger cooperation with the local actors and the civil society is recommended. An integrated approach (also paying attention to the issue of housing) of Roma inclusion is needed. Setting up a robust monitoring system would be necessary.

2.15 . Luxembourg

Document sent to the Commission on:		14 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	no estimate
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 300 i.e. 0.06 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: The principle of equal treatment and non-discrimination applies. School attendance obligatory for all resident youth, regardless of their nationality, mother tongue, and parents' legal status. Projects aimed at providing assistance and support to children newly arrived in Luxembourg and not speaking any of the official languages of this Member State.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Employment	Equal access to employment is guaranteed in compliance with EU and constitutional law.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Health	Equal access to the social protection system is guaranteed for all persons legally resident on the national territory. A high level of health protection and mandatory health and maternity insurance system is in place.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Housing	Local authorities provide, as far as possible, housing for all persons legally residing within their territory. Financial incentives in this respect provided.	
Structural requirements and funding	A special body (Comité pour l'élimination de la discrimination raciale CERD) gathering independent experts has been set to supervise the implementation of the international convention on elimination of all forms of racial discrimination.	

2.16. Hungary

Document sent to the Commission on:		6 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 750 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 700 000 i.e. 7.05 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The sound strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Compulsory pre-school participation from 3 years of age. After-school programmes. Second chance schools. Mediators. School meals.	More focus on desegregation, integrated education and ensuring that mainstream policies also respond to the specific needs of Roma could further improve this part of the strategy.
Employment	The sound strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: A very clear vision on raising employment in a systematic way, based on 3 pillars (integration into open and legal labour market; through active labour market policies; social economy; and public employment schemes for the most disadvantaged). Specific attention to job creation in rural areas, mainly in the agricultural sector.	More focus on reintegration to the open labour market, developing more concrete measures in the area of social economy, self-employment /microfinance and vocational training would be needed. Clear share of tasks and responsibilities among service providers and targeted services for Roma job-seekers via the public employment service could improve results. Possibilities of job creation in rural areas in sectors other than agriculture could also be considered.
Health	The sound strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Strong analytical part in the area of health. Acknowledgement of the need to target Roma women and children specifically. Active involvement of civil society and Roma representative foreseen in implementation of the strategy. Focus on geographically deprived areas (micro-regions) covering also non-Roma population living under the similar conditions as Roma. Training programmes for healthcare and social service workforce Measures to tackle unhealthy lifestyles.	Developing measurable targets and more specific measures to tackle problems identified would be necessary. A clearer timeline for implementation, reinforcing the budget would make measures more efficient.
Housing	It is particularly positive that a complex programme is in place for those living in segregated environment, conceived within an integrated approach.	More attention should be paid to social housing.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	Consultation with a wide range of stakeholders (Roma and civil society representatives, academics, local and regional authorities) took place when drafting the strategy. A territorial attention is paid to the situation of Roma and some meetings of consultation have taken place within the regions. Specific attention is paid to the situation of children as well as to raising awareness on discrimination. EU resources are quantified and listed for the planned measures targeting disadvantaged people. The strategy makes reference to the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD), without mentioning any amount.	The strategy would be even more precise if a detailed description of the monitoring and evaluation system was added. The sustainability of EU funded measures and the need to mobilise national resources requires further attention.

2.17. Malta

Document sent to the Commission on:		14 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	No Roma population
	Council of Europe estimates	0
Approach		No national strategy adopted

Malta did not adopt a national Roma integration strategy as there is no Roma population on its territory.

2.18. Netherlands

Document sent to the Commission on:		21 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	20 000 - 40 000
	Council of Europe estimates	Approximately 40 000 i.e. 0.24% of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Goal of increasing the overall participation of Roma in the education system, and in particular ensure that all young Roma finishes school. Decentralised implementation (at the level of municipalities). Creation of a specific platform gathering interested local authorities that have important Roma communities, in order to work on how to increase school attendance among Roma children.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Employment	Individual support is provided to jobseekers.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Health	There is a comprehensive legislation relating to non discriminatory access to healthcare in place.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Housing	Everyone with a low income who resides legally in the Netherlands, including Roma, is eligible for social housing.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Structural requirements and funding	The primary responsibility for dealing with the problems of the local Roma population lies with municipalities. Municipalities are encouraged to make effective use of existing measures to deal with problems within certain segments of local Roma communities. For the preparation of the document, the Roma Platform of Municipalities has been consulted.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.

2.19. Austria

Document sent to the Commission on:		16 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 50 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 25 000 i.e. 0.3 % of the population
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Within a broad education strategy, some innovative, tailor-made measures for Roma pupils are supported at local level. These include projects on Roma school assistants providing learning support for children and mediation, developed by Roma associations. Counselling and training adults so as to enhance their employability.	More measures taking into account the specificities of the different Roma groups are needed.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Diversity management within the Public Employment Service (including PES staff with migration background and training of staff). Within a general approach to labour market inclusion offering support to all job-seekers, some instruments for disadvantaged people and/or people with a migration background. The advice centre for Roma in Burgenland and projects providing intercultural coaching and training for Roma ("THARA" projects).	The approach should reach out to all Roma. Scaling up the current successful initiatives should be considered.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Accessible and affordable healthcare for all. Health insurance coverage extended to recipients of social assistance. Efforts to overcome language barriers in health care. Regional project on free access to psychotherapy to Roma victims of the holocaust and their descendants.	Scaling up initiatives, detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Relatively well developed social housing (in particular in Vienna). Projects against discrimination on the housing market.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Structural requirements and funding	The intention is declared to involve civil society organisations in the evaluation, further development and implementation of the measures. A discussion platform with stakeholders will be created.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary. A clear indication of the funding is also indispensable.

2.20. Poland

Document sent to the Commission on:		30 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 12 731
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 12 731 i.e. 0.10 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Focus on pre-school education. Roma teacher assistants and mediators. Funding children's transport to/from school. Funding meals at school. Compilation of textbooks and programmes of teaching the Romani language.	Focusing on desegregation and ensuring that other challenges like vocational education, learning of Polish language and gender issues should be adequately addressed.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Active labour market policy measures. Employment advisors providing assistance in the labour market, supporting entrepreneurship, subsidised jobs, vocational training.	Clearer measures to improve the public employment service, including accessible and targeted services for Roma job-seekers could improve results. Microfinance projects could enhance entrepreneurship.
Health	Specialised nurses are trained to better address Roma health needs.	Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Providing help for paying rent arrears; refurbishment of existing apartments and buildings; constructing of social flats, regulating the issue of land's property and its use, connecting houses with water supply and sewage systems.	The strategy could be further improved by concrete measures to provide non-discriminatory access to housing and more attention paid to an integrated approach.
Structural requirements and funding	The programme covers eight areas, including education, welfare (in fact housing), health and labour, but also culture and identity, civil society, security, and knowledge of the Roma community.	The sustainability of EU funded measures requires further attention. Specific attention should be devoted to applying an integrated approach. Involvement of local authorities in the implementation should be strengthened.

2.21. Portugal

Document sent to the Commission on:		2 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	Approximately 40 000 - 60 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 40 000 - 70 000, i.e. 0.52% of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Improving knowledge of the school situation of Roma students and trainees at school. Ensuring access to pre-school education; Increasing rates of school attendance, ensuring that all Roma children complete compulsory education. Encouraging students to stay on at secondary school, by providing incentives to higher education and training. Preventing early school leaving; Ensuring access to lifelong learning; Combating illiteracy.	More focus on desegregation and ensuring that mainstream policies also respond to the specific needs of Roma could further improve this part of the strategy.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Training staff and tailoring training provision to the specific characteristics of Roma communities. Facilitating access to employment and creation of self-employment. Improve vocational qualifications with a view to integration in the labour market. Developing an integrated approach to Roma communities, giving priority to working in partnership.	More attention should be dedicated to recent eco- nomic and social transformations and its implications.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Organising training/information actions on health education and available services. Preventive measures. Training health professionals in, and improving their awareness of, cultural diversity. Creating and/or strengthening close relations between health service providers and Roma communities.	Further work could be considered on monitoring progress in the implementation of the actions proposed and in health outcomes.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Development of a knowledge base on the housing conditions of Roma communities. Development of integration practices of Roma communities. Measures aimed at improving the housing conditions and access to housing.	The strategy could be further improved by concrete measures to provide non-discriminatory access to housing.
Structural requirements and funding	Roma communities participated in the preparation of the strategy and it is acknowledged that they should be more involved in its implementation. The strategy foresees the creation of a consultative body which will be responsible for the monitoring of the strategy.	Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation.

2.22. Romania

Document sent to the Commission on:		16 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 730 000 - 970 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 1 850 000 i.e. 8.32 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Stimulation of the participation of Roma children in early childhood education and care, training of school mediators, training and hiring Romani language teachers. Dedicated places in high schools and universities for Roma students. Network of school inspectors belonging to the Roma community. Clear inclusive approach, explicitly fighting against school segregation.	The strategy does not cover completion of primary school by all Roma children. The strategy does not identify clear targets on the educational attainment of Roma and is not founded on an adequate evidence base. A clear link with general programmes targeting disadvantaged groups and educational infrastructure would be necessary. The integration into the labour market of the trained school mediators should be supported.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Target to increase the number of Roma employees by 60 000, and the number of Roma female employees by 25 000. Promoting entrepreneurship among the Roma people. Stimulating agricultural activities and traditional crafts. Providing incentives to SMEs (infrastructure investments, loans, Roma employment subsidies).	The target is not commensurate with the size of unemployment. More attention is needed to the reduction of unemployment, in particular in the case of women and youth, as well as to increasing the skills of the Roma population and to promoting transition from undeclared to regular and from short to long-term employment. Social economy structures should also be addressed. The problems of rural areas and disadvantaged micro-regions and segregated neighbourhoods should be addressed specifically. Possibilities of job creation in rural areas including sectors other than agriculture should be considered.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Identification of key challenges (e.g. lack of medical staff in rural areas, and lack of health insurance among Roma). Target of increased access of Roma to public healthcare services and specific target on increasing the number of Roma health mediators. Health education campaigns in the field of prevention of tuberculosis in Roma communities. Vaccination campaigns for Roma children.	The proposed actions are welcome but insufficient in size and scope. The gap in access to health care and health outcomes affecting Roma should be addressed more effectively. Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation. The strategy would benefit from developing concrete measures to increase the health insurance coverage. Registration with local authorities is necessary.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: A number of combined programmes: social housing construction programme; social housing for Roma communities programme; social housing for tenant programme, etc. Regional development infrastructure project for 10 000 km of local and regional roads.	The strategy does not appropriately address access to (social) housing. Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation. The strategy could be improved by identifying areas with extremely poor communities and defining targeted measures to address the specificities of the situations.
Structural requirements and funding	Limited dialog with the local and regional authorities during the preparation of the Strategy and Action Plan. The civil society was formally consulted on the preparation of the Strategy. Specific attention is paid to the situation of children as well as to raising awareness on discrimination. Reference to European funding, as far as agriculture and rural development is concerned, without mentioning any amount.	The strategy does not reflect an integrated approach. The strategy would benefit from a clear prioritisation, a closer link between general and specific objectives, directions for actions and actual measures proposed, detailed description of clear targets, responsibilities, budget allocations, as well as of a robust monitoring and evaluation system. In the light of the considerable reliance on Structural Funds to support projects addressing the identified priorities, a significant improvement of the absorption capacity should be a priority. Closer involvement of the regional and local authorities and of Roma civil society in the implementation and monitoring phase should further improve the strategy. Effective coordination of implementation must be ensured.

2.23. Slovenia

Document sent to the Commission on:		30 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	7 000 - 10 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 8 500 i.e. 0.42 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Early childhood education measures. Developing confidence in education. Learning about Roma culture, eliminating prejudices. Raising the quality of education providers to Roma children, (support measures such as free lunches, textbooks, and school buses). Establishment of a support for learning network, in particular for Roma pupils in secondary education.	The implementation timeframe could have been more detailed.
Employment	A range of employment policy measures specifically targeted to Roma are defined aiming to increase their employability, with due consideration to the gender aspect.	The proposed measures could be more concrete.
Health	Measures aiming to improving health of the Roma, especially women and children. A pilot project in a region with more developed healthcare provision for the Roma.	More developed specific measures are needed with expected outcomes and mechanisms to monitor progress.
Housing	Legalisation of settlements as the legal condition for the construction of basic infrastructure.	Discrimination in renting/buying property and in access to public amenities in urban areas should be addressed.
Structural requirements and funding	Local authorities were fully involved in the preparation of the strategy. It is foreseen that they also play a role in the implementation of parts of it. The civil society was involved in the preparation of the strategy and it is foreseen that they play a role in the implementation. Representatives of the Roma community also participated in the preparation of the strategy. The implementation of the strategy will be monitored by a Commission composed of all relevant stakeholders in addition to civil servants.	The funding for specific measures in the programme is not always clearly specified.

2.24. Slovakia

Document sent to the Commission on:		11 January 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 440 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 500 000 i.e. 9.17 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Increasing pre-school participation of Roma children from 3 years of age. Increasing inclusiveness of the educational system and effectiveness of the social support system. Eliminating barriers in the transition to high schools; linking secondary education with the labour market's needs. Increasing the number of teachers and specialists fluent in Romani language.	More focus on desegregation, second chance education and ensuring that mainstream policies also respond to the specific needs of Roma could further improve this part of the strategy. Measures to develop local policies preventing 'non-Roma children flight' from schools attended by many Roma pupils would be needed. Compulsory pre-school education, offering increased financial support to high school and tertiary school students should be examined.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Supporting "second-chance" education and increasing training opportunities. Motivating public and private employers to adopt a culture of offering job opportunities to the marginalised and socially excluded. Improving non-discriminatory access to work opportunities.	High inactivity, long-term unemployment and low skill levels should be addressed by more specific measures and supported by adequate budgets. Ineffectiveness of current Active Labour Market Policy and public work creation should be also addressed with increased focus on effective integration to the open labour market. Public Employment Services providing accessible and targeted services for Roma job-seekers could improve results. Non-discriminatory access to the labour market, policies involving the majority population, schools, social partners, and media, to fight prejudice are necessary. Strengthening territorial aspects of policy making with focus on most disadvantaged regions should be considered. Possibilities of job creation in rural areas in sectors other than agriculture and forestry, e. g. traditional crafts and micro businesses should also be considered.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Improving accessibility of healthcare including preventive healthcare and health education. Improving hygiene in deprived Roma settlements. Considering resettlement, should the residents of such locations be under health risks. Improving the communication between the members of Roma communities and the medical personnel, focus on health education, awareness raising on sexual and reproductive health, drug addiction, and domestic violence in marginalised Roma communities.	A quantitative assessment of the health situation of Roma, greater focus on children and the role of the Roma health mediators would strengthen the strategy. Clear actions, responsibilities and budget need to be defined. Further work is needed to monitor progress and health outcomes.
Housing	The strategy envisages to the use EU funds (especially ERDF in the area of housing).	Concrete, more ambitious and integrated measures to provide non-discriminatory access to housing are necessary. The link between the goals and the process to reach them needs to be strengthened. The issue of eligibility for housing support for people with temporary residence in shelters or in undocumented dwellings should be addressed.
Structural requirements and funding	The strategy provides an accurate description of the Roma situation. A holistic approach is followed. Emphasis is put on cooperation with Roma civil society and local and regional authorities. An important aspect is the recognition of the need to work with the majority population to tackle widespread prejudices/stereotypes. The strategy also covers the area of Roma financial inclusion. The overall budget allocation is quantified (€141m) for the period 2011-2015. However, individual measures in the action plan do not always specify budget implications. The Slovak strategy plans to use ERDF for housing. The strategy makes reference to the European Agricultural Fund for Rural Development (EAFRD), without mentioning any amount.	The sustainability of EU funded measures requires further attention. Funding is not always properly quantified and appears to be insufficient. It would be useful to draw lessons from the past concerning the implementation of projects financed by structural funds. It will be also important to align Operational Programmes for the programming period 2014-2020 with the strategy. The commitment to a strong involvement of civil society and local authorities in planning and implementation should be ensured.

2.25. Finland

Document sent to the Commission on:		12 December 2011
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 10-12 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 11 000 i.e. 0.21 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Enhancing participation of Roma children in early childhood education. Development of cooperation and supporting parenting skills. Support transition stages in education. Enhancing the education of Roma adults and the promotion of their access to the labour market.	
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Enhancing the integration of Roma into labour market through more efficient public employment services. Development of new forms of employment for Roma and enhancing their entrepreneurship activities. Raising awareness of the Roma people of working life practices and provision of more information to employers on the prevention of discrimination against Roma and the elimination of prejudices.	
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Specific actions are multi-sectoral and adequate to meet the goals if properly implemented. They are mostly targeted at accessibility to and provision of social and health services as well as housing conditions with specific actions targeted to Roma children and the elderly. The strategy foresees to carry out an extensive survey with the purpose of acquiring data on welfare, health and living conditions of Roma population as well as their need for health services. Prevention of marginalisation and promotion of social welfare and healthcare. Provision of information to Roma on healthcare and social services.	

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Equal treatment in housing and reducing insecurity. Promotion of cross administrative cooperation at municipal level. Promotion of good local governance in solving the housing-related problems of individual Roma families.	
Structural requirements and funding	Consultation with a wide range of stakeholders, including Roma took place when drafting the strategy. Regional and local authorities as well as Roma are also given a very active role in the implementation of the strategy. Responsibilities of implementation are clearly divided among the relevant ministries. A detailed monitoring and steering plan is put in place until 2013.	Effective monitoring will depend on the capacity to develop its horizontal dimension. Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation.

2.26. Sweden

Document sent to the Commission on:		25 February 2012
Roma population	Estimate in the document	approximately 50 000
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 42 500 i.e. 0.46 % of the population
Approach		National strategy

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Pilot project in a number of localities in 2012-2015, with the involvement of the National Agency for Education and of the Schools Inspectorate. Development of knowledge and data on the situation of Roma in education. Training of school mediators. Information campaigns targeting local authorities. Producing teaching materials in Romani Chib language.	Developing funding and timeframe for the implementation would be needed.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Focus on the systematic actions and pilot projects run by the Public Employment Office and municipalities to improve the foothold of the Roma youth on the labour market. The possibility to introduce special mentors or "bridge builders" shall be analysed (as part of the pilot projects). The Public Employment Services (PES) is given the task to distribute information to the Roma and to make sure that the Roma receive the help they need (as part of the pilot projects).	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people would be useful. It would be pertinent to refer more to policies and measures in employ- ment for vulnerable groups, from which the Roma can also benefit.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: A number of measures to get better understanding of the health situation of Roma. Roma mediators in municipalities (pilot projects). Focus on health of Roma women.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Prevention of discrimination of the Roma on the housing market. The Government intends to give the Swedish National Board of Housing, Building and Planning (Boverket) the task to report on the housing situation of the Roma in order to better understand the housing situation of the Roma and to be able to achieve the target of equal housing.	Measuring the impact of the equal treatment approach on the situation of Roma people is necessary.
Structural requirements and funding	The strategy builds on the results of the work of a Roma delegation and subsequent public consultation. The 20-year strategy covers all 4 key areas, as well as culture/language and the empowerment of civil society. Local and regional authorities were involved in preparing the strategy and will have extensive responsibility in the implementation. Funding is secured from national budget. The Swedish Government will report yearly on progress in the annual budget bills to the Parliament. Evaluation of the implementation is foreseen after 5 years.	The lack of available data is a challenge to be addressed. EU funding could be used in a more extensive manner for supporting Roma inclusion.

2.27. United Kingdom

Document sent to the Commission on:		11 January 2011	
Roma population	Estimate in the document	80 000-300 000	
	Council of Europe estimates	approximately 225 000 i.e. 0.37 % of the population	
Approach		Integrated set of policy measures	

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Education	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Tailored support provided by local authorities to meet Roma and Travellers children educational needs (Scotland, Wales and Northern Ireland). Increasing accessibility, attendance through an "Action Framework on the education of children and young people from the Traveller community" (Northern Ireland). Raising educational aspirations and attainment of Roma and Traveller children (England). Free entitlement to early childhood education to around 40% of two-year olds by September 2014 (England). Reform of higher education aiming at widening access including from low income and other under-represented groups as well as scholarship to the least well-off students (England).	A lifelong learning approach, with focus on early childhood education (reference only made by England) and vocational training would have been relevant. An identification of quantifiable targets and budget allocation would be needed.
Employment	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Promoting entrepreneurship in schools in disadvantaged communities. Supporting English language provision for those who are not in employment and are unable to afford fees. Addressing the individual needs of people seeking work. Promoting social mobility through dialogue with businesses (England).	Employment is only mentioned regarding England. There is no identification of funding supporting the measures proposed.
Health	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Improving understanding and better responding to the needs of Roma and Travellers (Scotland). Improving the actions targeted at Travellers' health and well-being (Northem Ireland). Eliminating discriminatory practices and negative perceptions of Roma and Travellers, raising awareness of the health needs of Roma and Traveller communities and improving access to health services (Wales). Improving health outcomes for Roma and Travellers (England).	Monitoring and budget allocations are needed to secure the effective implementation.

	KEY ELEMENTS	IDENTIFIED GAPS
Housing	The strategy includes in particular the following positive elements: Consideration to the housing needs of Roma and Travellers in planning and local authority provision of accommodation (Scotland). Land identification for sites and site provision for the Traveller population (Northern Ireland). Integrated approach when building the new sites (Wales). Encouraging appropriate site provision; building on £60 million Traveller Pitch Funding and New Homes Bonus incentives (England).	Detailing a calendar, targets, indicators, and budget are needed to secure the effective implementation.
Structural requirements and funding	The role of the local level is crucial in taking the lead for the integration of Roma and Travellers. A wide range of stakeholders (Roma and Travellers, local authorities etc.) have been involved in drafting the UK strategies. The fight against discrimination and empowering Roma and Travellers is a key aspect of all UK strategies.	The strategy would be even more precise if a detailed description of the timeframe, monitoring and evaluation system was added.

